

CRA Annual Report 2016

The Carlton Residents Association advocates for the residents of Carlton. CRA is a democratic, non-party political body. This short report highlights what CRA achieved for Carlton and the key activities of the association in 2016. The report also outlines the work of valued CRA members who are now moving on to other roles.

CRA achievements in 2016

The section below describes CRA's two improvements to the amenity of Carlton and three successful contests to inappropriate development in 2016.

Improved amenity

Carlton now has a well-stocked **toy library** in the beautifully renovated chapel on Cardigan Street. The Toy Library was a direct result of years of intense lobbying by CRA members Jackie Watts and Greta Bird. CRA lobbied for the Toy Library as a partial amelioration for privatizing 3.5 hectares of space on the Carlton Public Housing Estates despite the desperate need for additional public housing and community resources.

CRA worked with Council and VicRoads to introduce **traffic calming measures in Cardigan St**. The following measures have been implemented, led by Ian Bird.

- New 'pedestrian' signs have been installed from Lytton to Faraday Streets to alert motorists.
- Restricted entry signs from Lygon Street at Lytton & Palmerston Streets are designed and agreed.
- A 40kph speed zone is with VicRoads to approve.
- The median opening between the University carpark and Lt Elgin St has been completed.

Planning

CRA worked with the Council and King and Godfree to negotiate **a better outcome for all parties on the re-development of the King & Godfree site**. The new terrace bar and brasserie will address concerns of nearby residents on noise and music levels and later closing hours. CRA's acoustic impact assessment, our presence at VCAT and our willingness to enter into negotiations, contributed substantially to the successful outcome. CRA was represented by Ian Bird and Malcolm Foo in the matter.

CRA and Council opposed a 16-level development at 558-566 Swanston Street. **The development was reduced by two levels and the architectural composition of two levels was changed** to retain visual interest to the east.

The Planning Working Group, led by Warren Green, analyses all proposed developments in Carlton and organizes opposition to developments which are inappropriate. A one-page report of the Planning Working Group's activities is attached in Appendix 1.

CRA's key activities in 2016

Candidates Forums for the Federal and Local Government Elections

CRA hosted two candidate forums, one for the Federal election and the other for the Melbourne City Council election. Both forums were well attended by candidates and the general public. The forums were held at the Church of All Nations and ably facilitated by Dr John Evans [Federal Event] and Brian Shanahan [Council Event] and organized by Ian and Greta Bird.

Strategic Planning issues: Led by Ewan Ogilvy, CRA provided input into three planning reviews of strategic importance to Carlton:

1. Heritage Review: CRA provided comment on the revised grading system and the negative potential of that system in downgrading the heritage status of many sites in Carlton.
2. Managing Residential Development Committee: CRA advocated for clear planning guidance in the parts of Carlton subject to these controls, north of Grattan and Carlton streets.
3. Better Apartments Design Standards: CRA advocated for key design elements including natural light and ventilation, noise impacts, energy efficiency and waste management.

Illegal demolition of the Corkman Hotel: On the initiative of Greta Bird, CRA provided a submission to the Minister of Planning and the City of Melbourne on this issue. As a result of this submission and others, the Minister imposed a two-year design and development overlay on the site including requiring the developer to restore and reconstruct the building. Further details are provided in Appendix 2.

Future Planning: CRA Future Planning Working Group, led by Farida Fleming, developed a medium-term plan for the association, which will be tested with members at the 2017 AGM. The Working Group surveyed CRA members, reviewed key documents, and interviewed stakeholders in developing the draft plan.

Newsflash: Lyn Cracknell produced and edited CRA's four 2016 editions of Newsflash. The newsletter continues to be the public face of CRA and contains key information for Carlton residents.

Carlton Gardens: CRA, represented by Brian Falconer, continued to advocate for the disbursement of the State Government allocation of \$20 million for the Dome refurbishment. CRA, represented by Brian and John Weickhardt, continued to engage with Council to improve standards so that damage to the Carlton Gardens is reduced from the Melbourne International Flower and Garden Show.

Appreciation

CRA could not achieve anything without the input of its members – so thanks to all members for everything you do. CRA would like to acknowledge its debt of gratitude to Ian and Greta Bird. Their unremitting work over 18 years leaves us with a better Carlton. While they will no longer serve on CRA in a formal capacity, they remain committed members. CRA acknowledges the service of George Janko, Julie Harrison and Malcolm Foo. While each has had to step back from CRA Committee positions due to other commitments, they also remain committed members.

Appendix 1: Planning Group Report for 2016

Committee: Warren Green (Convenor), Malcolm Foo, Ewan Ogilvy, Denis Toth, John Weickhardt
The preceding were joined by Cameron White last year.

The Committee monitors planning scheme amendments and issues of a strategic nature.

In addition, the CRA Planning Committee meets to consider the planning applications for the previous month for the 3053 postcode. The committee is particularly alert to the following:

- whether the application complies with any heritage overlay, height controls and internal amenity issues (primarily in multi-dwelling developments)
- significant loss of amenity to the wider surrounding area (urban design, sunlight etc)
- overlooking or any other significant loss of amenity to neighbouring properties

1. Strategic Planning Issues

During 2016 CRA prepared submissions for planning scheme amendments and reviews. A summary of which is attached.

2.Planning Applications

2016 saw a reduction in the year on year numbers for planning applications lodged with the CoM, however an increase in the number of objections by CRA. The planning committee reviewed 149 and submitted 13 objections, an increase of 44% despite the reduced number of applications and the virtual exclusion of third party objection rights in the extended Capital City Zone.

The number of complex objections has increased due to the surge of major projects being submitted for planning approval. This is placing additional demands on the planning group's limited resources.

The CoM and CRA have generally been in agreement on the major applications this year and CoM's refusal to grant permits has lead to VCAT hearings for those below in bold print. The outcomes at VCAT this year have reflected concessions to the CoM and CRA's preferred outcomes rather than victories.

The following is a summary of the past three years.

2016	149 Applications	13 Objections
2015	177 Applications	9 Objections
2014	119 Applications	2 Objections

Details of the objections submitted, including their status, can be found on our website. They related to:

TP-2014-953	61-63 Lt. Palmerston St.- Alterations to existing dwelling including 3 storey extension.
TP-2015-742	86-94 Pelham St - Construction 8 storey mixed use development
TP-2015-1057	558-566 Swanston St - 16 storey mixed use development
TP-2015-1146	122-136 Berkeley St - 12 storey mixed use development
TP-2016-46	205 Pelham St & 81 Barry St - 13 storey student accommodation
TP-2016-188	291-299 Lygon St - King & Godfree - Change of use, roof top bar & entertainment
TP-2016-248	10 &14 Drummond Pl - Construct 2 new dwellings on vacant land
TP-2016-259	599-605 Swanston St - Construct 20 storey student accommodation
TP-2016-474	435-439 Cardigan St - Alterations and additions to existing student accommodation
TP-2016-510	163 &165 Canning St - Demolition 2 terrace houses and construct 2 new dwellings
TP-2016-798	197-235 Bouverie St -(220-234 Leicester St} Melb Uni, partial demolition & re-development
TP-2016-864	10 & 14 Drummond Pl - Construct 2 new dwellings on vacant land
TP-2014-1011/A	377-391 Cardigan St - Clyde Hotel, construct roof top terrace & consumption of liquor

Outright victories may be rare, but serious concessions are often achieved.

CRA has frequently been challenged by the applicant's advocate at VCAT to advise where are those people who are most directly affected by this alleged inappropriate development? So, objections from individuals, especially those in close proximity to the proposed development, add considerable weight to any submission by CRA, We encourage all members to keep this in mind when inappropriate development is proposed.

We encourage any member with experience or a serious interest in planning issues, to contact the group convenor. Your input would be welcomed.

Further information on the above applications should be available on the CoM website.
www.melbourne.vic.gov.au/BuildingandPlanning/Planning/Pages/PlanningRegisterSearch.aspx

Planning Committee monthly reports and summaries are available on the CRA website.

Appendix 2: CRA Planning Group – Strategic Planning Concerns – 2016

Heritage Review

This Heritage Review was instigated by the City of Melbourne in 2014. Association members have been involved in several discussions with both Councillors and Council Officers over the last two years.

During the summer of 2015-16, concerned residents were asked to comment upon a new Statement of Significance for the large Carlton Heritage Precinct, and revisions to the two local policies which guide decision makers responsible for assessing planning applications that impact upon heritage places. But, it is the replacement of the A to D Grading system [a system that has been in place for thirty years] with a revised system, that categorises properties as significant, contributory or non-contributory that will have the most impact.

It is expected that all three elements of this initiative, including the revised policies and the new Statement of Significance, will be exhibited in February 2017

Managing Residential Development

During the last week of April, the CRA presented a submission to this Committee. This Committee was established by the current Minister for Planning [The Hon. Richard Wynne, MP] to report on the application of the zones that provide for residential development. For the suburb of Carlton, these were the zones introduced by the previous Minister for Planning in late 2014. More particularly, these new controls only affected that part of Carlton north of Grattan and Carlton Streets.

In the view of the Association, key planning controls should establish unambiguous guidance as to the desired development outcomes. In the experience of the CRA, where guidance is ambiguous, some applicants will test the boundaries with provocative development proposals, which often result in very time consuming and challenging VCAT hearings

It is expected that the Report from the Committee, and the Government's response to this Report will be released in early 2017.

Better Apartments Design Standards

During 2016 the Planning Group responded to Draft Design Standards that had been developed by the State Government. This was a difficult issue for Planning Group members, since there was little consensus over whether the Government should introduce apartment size restrictions. Accordingly, the CRA submission emphasised other key design elements including natural light and ventilation, noise impacts, energy efficiency and water management. It is expected that new standards will come into effect in March 2017 when they are implemented in the Victoria Planning Provisions and all planning schemes.

The Corkman Hotel Demolition

This heritage listed pub, formerly known as the Carlton Inn, was illegally demolished by developers over the weekend of the 15 and 16 of October. The illegal demolition quickly galvanised a wide range of groups to take action, including the National Trust, Melbourne Heritage Action and the CRA. By the 27 October, both the State Government and the City had launched a joint action in the Victorian Civil and Administrative Tribunal to compel the owners to rebuild the pub. If VCAT ruled in favour of the government and council, an enforcement order would require a rebuild in line with the design, scale and layout of the demolished building.

In response to submissions from the CRA and other parties, the Minister for Planning also imposed a two-year design and development overlay over the site. This overlay requires the applicant to 'restore and reconstruct in facsimile the building at 160 Leicester [Street], Carlton as it stood immediately prior to its demolition in October 2016 ...'