

CRA Annual Report 2018

The Carlton Residents Association advocates for the residents of Carlton. CRA is a democratic, non-party political body. This short report highlights what CRA achieved for Carlton and the key activities of the association in 2018.

CRA achievements and activities in 2018

Planning

The planning committee reviewed 138 proposals and submitted 9 objections, (a list of which is contained in the accompanying planning report). The number of objections developed in 2018 was a reduction of 43 per cent over 2017. This is, in part, a result of the expanded Capital City Zone, in which third party objection rights have been severely diminished. Overall the decisions this year have reflected concessions to CRA's preferred outcomes rather than victories. Details of the objections submitted, including their status, can be found on our website.

One of these applications is of serious concern to CRA and residents: TP-2018-892. The property of concern is 16-20 & 22 Drummond St. The applicants are proposing the near complete [except for facade] demolition of 4 existing dwellings and construction of new 6 storey residential development. Should this application be approved in this particularly sensitive heritage precinct, it would create a regrettable precedent to be exploited in the future. As at 25 January, 46 objections had been lodged with the CoM. Further detail is provided in Appendix 1.

Strategic Planning Issues

CRA developed submissions in relation to the Heritage Review Amendment C258 Melbourne Planning Scheme. The major issue canvassed by CRA during the Panel Hearing [and in earlier submissions] concerned the efficacy of the translation of the old letter grades [to signify the level of significance of a heritage place] to the new grading system of Significant, Contributory and Non-Contributory. In the view of the CRA, the different heritage consultants retained by the City have not been consistent in the way in which this translation project has been undertaken, resulting in the downgrading of heritage status for hundreds of properties across Carlton. Copies of the CRA Submission to the Panel Hearing is available on the CRA website. <http://www.carltonresidents.org.au/cra-2012/heritage/>

CRA provided three submissions to the review of Heritage Places of Carlton. This more comprehensive study of the Heritage Places of Carlton is confined to that section of Carlton to the east of Swanston Street.

CRA will pursue key issues with City of Melbourne Officers: the undemocratic Exemption provisions that exist in City North area, problems with the application of the Design and Development Overlay Objectives and guidelines, and ineffective Council Policies [including the Student Housing Policy]. Further detail is provided in Appendix 2.

[Traffic, Transport, Parking and Noise Abatement \(TTPNA\) working group](#)

The Traffic, Transport, Parking and Noise Abatement (TTPNA) working group has made some progress on several fronts and laid the ground for further efforts.

The TTPNA Working Group developed a Vehicular Noise Abatement Proposal. Copies of this proposal were sent to the new Lord Mayor, all CoM councillors and also to the MLA for Melbourne, Ellen Sandell, who is interested in seeking solutions to the problem. The proposal focusses on the initiatives that the CoM can take without needing to enlist the cooperation of other entities, not least being the halving of speed limits and the installation of double and treble speed humps at various intersections... at costs that are trifling in contrast with those of accidents and sleeplessness. This has already led to a meeting with CoM's engineering department in which speed humps were discussed at some length. Comprehension that problem is noise, not speed alone, may not yet have occurred in all quarters. Contact CRA if you would like to receive a copy of the Proposal or to become involved in the activities of the TTPNA working group.

In the course of 2019 and, if necessary, beyond, similar attention will be directed to the EPA, VP, VicRoads and State and Federal Government agencies, with other recommendations tailored to their own separate responsibilities.

It cannot say, however, that its 2017 meeting with City of Melbourne (CoM) and Melbourne Metro Rail Authority has achieved the slightest alleviation of the problems arising from the doubling of the number of lanes in Queensberry Street. In particular, there has been no change in the loss of 106 car parking spaces in that street and its becoming a drawcard for noise emitted by exhaust-modified motor bikes, cars and utilities which have integrated this street in a circuit that runs mostly from afternoon until the small hours of each ensuing day. The absence of trams in that street, as is the case for Cardigan Street and much of Lygon and Elgin Streets makes it doubly attractive for this social nuisance and ultimate public health impairment.

We would like to think it was registration by us of vehicular noise emission at several Melbourne North Police-Community Consultative Committee meetings that led to joint Victoria Police (VP)-Environment Protection Authority (EPA) operations on two Friday evenings, one in May and the other in October, which resulted in a large number of apprehensions followed by many fines and referrals to compulsory EPA testing. Unfortunately, the problem has continued totally unabated. To be effective, these operations need to be conducted far, far more frequently from alternating positions in Carlton streets, and in such a way that VP is able to recognize and ultimately punish repeat offenders.

[Mayoral Electoral Forum](#)

CRA facilitated a candidate forum for the City of Melbourne Mayoral Election on Monday 23 April at the Church of All Nations, Carlton. Eleven of the fourteen candidates who nominated for the role of Lord Mayor attended the forum: Sally Capp, Rohan Leppert, Sally Warhaft, Allan Watson, Jennifer Yang, Katie Sfetkidis, Gary Morgan, Nathalie O'Sughrue, Michael Burge, Ken Ong, Bruce Poon. The wide range of views and experience among the candidates, including a number of new faces, attracted a large crowd to a Forum.

Question time gave residents the opportunity to identify their concerns: the Queen Victoria Market project; closing city streets to cars to reduce congestion; housing affordability; planning and design issues including protection of heritage; equal voting rights for residents; Council- State Government relations and the need for transparency of governance by Council. The discussion recognised that preferences may determine the outcome where there are so many candidates.

State Election Candidates Forum

CRA facilitated a candidate forum for the seat of Melbourne as part of the Melbourne State Election. The forum was held on Monday 12 November at the Church of All Nations, Carlton. Four State election candidates accepted the invitation to attend the Forum: Peter Hanlon (Independent), Jennifer Kanis (Labor), Ellen Sandell (Greens), and Leo Close (Reason Party). Leo was an apology on the night. The forum was moderated by Sarah Howe.

Carlton Neighbour Day 2018

Some 600 people attended Carlton Neighbour Day which was set up in Faraday Street, outside Kathleen Syme Library and Community Centre. They enjoyed the play zones, live music, craft and technology workshops, petting zoo, information stalls, delicious food and amazing Bukjeh art performances and the Long Lunch.

Special appreciation to Carlton Primary and Carlton Gardens Primary schools for engaging students in the Carlton Neighbour Day Community Art Prize.

A particular success was engaging 14 businesses to support the event. These businesses provided \$1,800 in prizes and in-kind support.



City of Melbourne's Safe City Camera Program (SCCP) Audit Committee

A CRA Committee member participates on the City of Melbourne's Safe City Cameras Program (SCCP) Audit Committee. The SCCP closed circuit TV (CCTV) surveillance cameras are installed throughout the city. The cameras help to create a safer environment and reduce crime levels by deterring potential offenders and helping in crime detection.

At the commencement of the SCCP, the City of Melbourne established an external Audit Committee whose functions are to:

- provide an independent review and checking mechanism for the camera program that ensures that it meets the requirements of its Protocols and Operating Procedures
- promote public confidence in the camera program by ensuring its operations are transparent to the public and under ongoing independent scrutiny and review
- recommend action that will safeguard the camera program against abuse

The operations of the camera program are examined by the Audit Committee to ensure that the use of the cameras

- continues to be for designated purposes only
- complies with the protocols and procedures
- does not compromise the privacy and rights of the general public through any unauthorised use

The Audit Committee provides a written audit report to Council on an annual basis. This report evaluates the operations of the camera program and compliance with the Protocols and Operating Procedures. More information and the Audit Committee's past reports can be found here <https://www.melbourne.vic.gov.au/community/safety-emergency/Pages/safe-city-cameras.aspx>

Newsflash and website

Both the Website and Newsletter report on the work of CRA and also provide information relating to life in Carlton and issues of broader community interest.

Three Newsletters were produced during 2018 and were distributed in both hard copy and electronically to members and other interested parties, such as politicians and community groups.

Thank you to the small group of volunteers who have helped with the hand delivery in the Carlton area.

The Newsflash is produced with the help of a very small group of editorial volunteers – their work is much appreciated.

The website capacity has recently been increased. It is a good resource regarding issues affecting Carlton and the work of CRA. Any problems encountered accessing the website or suggestions for inclusions can be advised via the CRA email address: carltonresidents@gmail.com

If you feel you can contribute to any of the items mentioned please make contact with the association.

Support to attend the Australian Open

CRA provided a grant to the Community Tennis Coaching Program (which is for families originating from the Horn of Africa) to attend 2 days of the Australian Open. It was part of an initiative by Tennis Australia to promote its grassroots Hot Shots children's program.

2018 AGM

AGM attendees were treated to an exceptional panel discussion: Good governance in the 'post truth age'. The panelists – Dr Matthew Sharpe, Associate Professor of Philosophy at Deakin University and Misha Ketchell, editor of The Conversation – an independent, not-for-profit media outlet - both spoke briefly to initiate questions and comments.

The following committee members and office bearers were voted in:

- Ivana Csar, President
- Trish O'Loughlin, Vice President
- Philip Watts, Treasurer
- Farida Fleming, Secretary
- Lester Levinson, Ordinary Member
- Lisa Adams, Ordinary Member
- Margaret Rode, Ordinary Member

2018 Christmas Party

CRA was treated to the experiences and reflections of two long-time community activists, Margaret Portelli and Margaret O'Brien of Fitzroy Residents Association. The speakers spoke of a number of shared concerns, including advocating for best use of the Carlton Gardens, as well as a number of issues particular to Fitzroy. Special thanks to La Mama for again providing a wonderful venue (and shelter from the pouring rain!), Brunetti and Clyde Hotel for providing generous amounts of food, our raffle ticket sponsors, and our talented musician.

Special note

Warren Green resigned as convenor of the Planning Working Group at the February Planning Group meeting. This means there is an urgent need for a replacement convenor. CRA would like to note its sincere thanks for his hard work over many, many years. Thank you – Warren. Our suburb is better for all you have done.

Appendix 1: Planning Group Report for 2018

Committee: Warren Green (Convenor), Mark Cleary, Clive Miller, Ewan Ogilvy, Andrew Spencer, Dennis Toth.

The Carlton Residents Association advocates on behalf of its members to:

- Support the retention of the heritage assets within Carlton and to discourage new development that fails to respect these assets.
- Maintain the quality of the public realm with a focus upon maintaining access to sunlight and sky views, and a pedestrian friendly scale.
- Interpret and apply the performance-based provisions of the Melbourne Planning Scheme fairly so that the interests of no one party are unfairly privileged over the interests of another party.

To facilitate the above, the Planning Group monitors planning scheme amendments and issues of a strategic nature and regularly meets to consider the planning applications lodged with the CoM for post code 3053.

1. Strategic Planning Issues

During 2018 CRA prepared submissions for the following planning scheme amendments and reviews:

- The Heritage Review Planning Scheme Amendment C258
- CoM Review of Carlton Heritage
- The Corkman Hotel [Demolished without approval]. Although the CRA commented upon the proposed Am C320, the Council subsequently abandoned this proposal when the Minister approved a separate Amendment in October 2018
- Melbourne Innovation District [The January 2019 CRA Committee meeting agreed that this should be a Community Engagement priority for 2019]

Details of these are summarised in the accompanying attachment.

2. Planning Applications

The year on year figures for planning applications lodged with the CoM appears to have stabilised for 2018, The planning committee reviewed 138 proposals and submitted 9 objections, a reduction of 43 per cent over 2017. This is, in part, a result of the expanded Capital City Zone, in which third party objection rights have been severely diminished.

In contrast, the workload generated by the numerous planning scheme amendments and reviews has exploded to the extent that it has been a virtual full-time pursuit for Ewan this past year.

Overall the decisions this year have reflected concessions to CRA's preferred outcomes rather than victories.

The following is a summary of the past four years planning application activity.

2018	138 Applications	9 Objections
2017	131 Applications	16 Objections
2016	149 Applications	13 Objections
2015	177 Applications	9 Objections
2014	119 Applications	2 Objections

Details of the objections submitted, including their status, can be found on our website. They related to:

TP-2017-537	195-197 Palmerston St - Demolish existing dwelling and construct 3 new dwellings
TP-2017- 828	498-504 Swanston St - 18 storey student accommodation and retail ground floor
TP-2018- 59	6-10 MacArthur Place Nth - Part demolition and construction of 3 new storey additions
TP-2018-228	19 Owen St - Part demolition, alterations and additions to existing dwelling
TP-2006-92/C	172-174 Faraday St - Carlton Wine Room - Extend trading hours in a residential zone
TP-2018-422	111-113 Cardigan St - 3 storey dwelling plus roof terrace on 2 consolidated sites
TP-2018-449	23-31 Lincoln sq Sth - Part demolition, construct 14 storey mixed use development
TP-2018-510	66 Palmerston St - Part demolition of existing dwelling
TP-2018-892	16-20 & 22 Drummond St - Near complete [except for facade] demolition of 4 existing dwellings and construction of new 6 storey residential development

The last item is of serious concern to CRA. Should this application be approved in this particularly sensitive heritage precinct, it would create a regrettable precedent to be exploited in the future. As at 25 January, 46 objections had been lodged with the CoM.

3. General

The Planning Group has benefited from Andrew's urban design expertise since his joining the Group in April. Warren resigned as convenor at the February planning group meeting. This means there is an urgent need for a replacement convenor.

CRA has frequently been challenged during the objection process to comment on the absence of "those people who are most directly affected by an alleged inappropriate development".

So, objections from individuals, especially those in close proximity to the proposed development, add considerable weight to any submission by CRA. We encourage all members to keep this in mind when inappropriate development is proposed.

Any member with experience or a serious interest in planning issues, is encouraged to contact CRA. Your input would be welcomed.

Further information on the above applications should be available on the CoM website.

www.melbourne.vic.gov.au/BuildingandPlanning/Planning/Pages/PlanningRegisterSearch.aspx

CRA's Planning Group monthly reports and summaries are available on the CRA website.

WG - 01 February 2019

Appendix 2: Strategic Planning Report – Overview of key 2018 Activities

Heritage Review Amendment C258 Melbourne Planning Scheme. The Panel Hearings in relation to this citywide Planning Scheme Amendment commenced in August 2018 [and continued in 2019]. The major issue canvassed by the CRA during the Panel Hearing [and in earlier submissions] concerned the efficacy of the translation of the old letter grades [to signify the level of significance of a heritage place] to the new grading system of Significant, Contributory and Non-Contributory. In the view of the CRA, the different heritage consultants retained by the City have not been consistent in the way in which this translation project has been undertaken. Copies of the CRA Submission to the Panel Hearing are available on the CRA website. <http://www.carltonresidents.org.au/cra-2012/heritage/>

Review of the Heritage Places of Carlton. This more comprehensive study of the Heritage Places of Carlton is confined to that section of Carlton to the east of Swanston Street. Community responses to this study were required by the 19th November. Over the course of the consultation period, Ewan forwarded three submissions to the City of Melbourne; these addressed errors in the Heritage Overlay Maps; problems with the Street Numbering System, Heritage Overlay boundary issues and the issue of Social Significance. It is expected that the formal Exhibition of this Amendment will take place in 2019.

Melbourne Innovation District [MID] - City North. At the Future Melbourne Committee on the 13 November 2018, the Council approved the **Draft MID City North Urban Realm Action Plan**. In the covering purpose statement, Councillors were advised that:

The Draft Plan outlines the steps needed to enhance the urban realm of the City of Melbourne's university area to the north of Melbourne's central business district – referred to as MID City North. MID City North is the first district of the MID partnership established in 2017 between the City of Melbourne, RMIT University and the University of Melbourne.

In addition to including the main campuses of RMIT University and the University of Melbourne, MID City North encompasses the Queen Victoria Market, the Victorian State Library, the Parkville West biomedical and hospital precinct, and the Melbourne Museum and Royal Exhibition Building.

Of central concern to the CRA Planning Group was the possible introduction of a new Commercial 3 zoning control over much of the Carlton suburb. If this occurred, this new zoning would introduce the undemocratic Exemption provisions [that currently apply over the existing City North area] and provisions that would severely restrict the current rights enjoyed by existing owners of residential property. Further information is available on the Participate Melbourne website <https://participate.melbourne.vic.gov.au/melbourne-innovation-districts>

Planning Challenges faced by Carlton community. Key issues that should be taken up with City of Melbourne Officers include the undemocratic Exemption provisions that exist in City North area, Problems with the application of the Design and Development Overlay Objectives and guidelines, and Ineffective Council Policies [including the Student Housing Policy]. Warren Green [Convenor of the Planning Group] has been given in-principle agreement for a meeting with a senior statutory planner.

Corkman Hotel. Early in 2018 the City of Melbourne prepared an Amendment to the Planning Scheme [C320] which proposed that specific controls for the Corkman site be incorporated into the existing Design and Development Overlay [DDO61]. However, as the Minister approved a separate Am C346 on the 18 October in 2018, the CoM agreed that their earlier Amendment should be abandoned. The latest Am C346 applies an Incorporated Plan Overlay Schedule 6 over the site, which will require the current owner to prepare an Incorporated Plan. Unfortunately this new Schedule 6 will not REQUIRE the current owners to reinstate the valued heritage fabric of the illegally demolished pub, or require any new development on the site to “fall within” a modified building envelope.