

CRA Annual Report 2019

The Carlton Residents Association advocates for the residents of Carlton. CRA is a democratic, non-party political body. This short report highlights what CRA achieved for Carlton and the key activities of the association in 2019.

CRA achievements and activities in 2019

Planning

CRA engaged in mediation and education of possible objectors. CRA had multiple successful meetings and telephone conversations with residents who were looking to object to an inappropriate development or wanted further information regarding the process.

Two important outcomes this year were a successful objection for an inappropriate development in Drummond Street (16-20&22 Drummond St) and brokering of a mediated solution to the Elgin Street development.

The proposed development for **16-20 & 22 Drummond Street, Carlton** was for a 6 storey (approx 20.5m) building which exceeded the height controls of 10m and 13.5m by a wide margin. CRA believed that this proposal was inappropriate within the heritage streetscape and its proximity of the Royal Exhibition Building, and that this would create a precedent for the low scale eastern corner of Carlton. CRA was able to engage 45 residents/neighbours in lodging objections with the CoM. CoM, CRA and a number of objectors contested the development at VCAT and VCAT determined that no permit should be granted.

The second main issue was the development of the old Elgin Street scrap yards (**137-145 Elgin St**). Local residents were concerned about noise, given the number of proposed patrons in the venue, opening hours and waste collection. CRA met with local residents and was in contact with the developer. CRA was able to successfully convey residents concerns and advise residents of the development application processes and ways to organise to convey critical issues. The developer made a number of useful changes to its plans in order to accommodate local resident concerns.

Details of strategic planning issue are provided in Appendix 1.

Traffic, Transport, Parking and Noise Abatement (TTPNA) working group

2019 began with CRA having lodged a Vehicular Noise Abatement Proposal with the City of Melbourne. This proposal identified areas of action in which the Council could act without needing to obtain time-consuming cooperation, nor having to tip-toe around lines of demarcation, of Victoria Police, the Environment Protection Authority, VicRoads and the State Government.

This led to meetings which, while informative, saw Traffic Engineering and Engineering Services functions in the Council trying to interpret solutions to hooning instead in terms of speed and traffic intensity in which they have invested much time, contracted surveys and

equipment installation. There is almost total unwillingness to recognize that noise is the issue, not speed.

We have made a start with trying to define how Victoria Police can help control this scourge (without needing cooperation of other instrumentalities) and have had an initial interview with the head of Highway Patrol covering the Melbourne and Yarra municipalities. This has taken place in the context of CRA representatives attending bi-monthly meeting of the Melbourne North Police-Community Consultative Committee.

While we have to persist in this area, we were pleased to learn in mid-2019 that the UK is experimenting with vehicular noise cameras and expects to arrive at conclusions on their suitability for controlling wanton motor bike and car noise. This could change the name of the game and lead Harley-Davidsons and Lamborghinis, before their petrol-fuelled extinction, to become a money-spinner for the Council.

On another noise issue, that of late night rubbish collections, where we have not been able to convince the offenders directly, it is pleasing to say City of Melbourne Health services have shown they can deal with managements of waste collection firms in order to bring about rescheduling in areas where there are residents sleeping.

[Carlton Harmony Day 2019](#)

Carlton Harmony Day 2019 was a great success despite stormy wind and heavy rain. CRA partnered with the Carlton Neighbourhood Learning Centre, City of Melbourne, Cultivating Community and College Square on the Carlton Harmony Day 2019 Community Lunch. Over 200 people attended, including a good diversity of participants. The community lunch encouraged people to interact as they shared a meal. Ten volunteer hosts engaged participants and connected them with others at each table.

Wurundjeri Elder Tony Garvey & his son gave the Welcome to Country along with a Smoking Ceremony. Carlton Harmony Day engaged local micro-businesses to provide additional food for those people who could not bring food on the day: Harari Kitchen, Little Eritrean Kitchen and Hong's catering. Local artist and resident, Muhubo Sulieman, showcased her traditional Somali dwelling, or aqal, made of weaving done by local residents as part of a participatory art project. Over 20 volunteers, including international students and members of Church of all Nations (CAN), supported the day by setting up, serving and washing up.

Activities engaged adults and children and included:

- Facepainting
- Children's Toy Library
- Play activities at the basketball courts
- Badge making
- Giant games including chess, jenga, connect four and more
- Weaving art installation and activities
- Henna artist, East African coffee service and Somali craft display

[Green Spaces Game, Living Pavilion](#)

CRA ran a session on making green spaces in Carlton at the Living Pavilion on 11 May 2019. The Living Pavilion was a transdisciplinary project of the University of Melbourne that connected Indigenous knowledge, ecological science, sustainable design and participatory arts.

CRA's session brought 15 people together to explore common stakeholder issues in support and opposition to greening initiatives through an interactive game. Workshop participants worked towards win-win solutions and then considered how to apply that thinking to local action in Carlton.

Participants found value in the game as shown below by a selection of feedback comments.

Great experience of the value of collaboration and diverse thinking that comes from this kind of multi-stakeholder process

I liked the idea of having to adopt a "character" that is NOT you ... it makes you think about [and through] issues that you may have avoided!

The game is available on CRA's website. Contact Lisa Adams or Farida Fleming (carltonresidents@gmail.com) if you would like any further advice on using the game.

[Lord Mayor Sally Capp attends CRA meeting September 16, 2019](#)

The Lord Mayor, Sally Capp, addressed CRA at the September monthly meeting. Key issues discussed included:

- Tackling the challenge of a fast-growing city- how we do this has ramifications for generations to come.
- Environmental Questions: wind power, solar power - How can residents be involved? - How does council policy in this area relate to reality?
- Housing: for all sectors of the community - The role of local government? Traffic and parking: a fine balance of the needs of residents, businesses and visitors.
- Transport: the free transport zone - extend or discard?
- Planning: How do we preserve the heritage and culture of our neighbourhoods?

[Newsflash and website](#)

Four editions of Newsflash were produced in 2019 with the much-valued editorial assistance of Frank Chamberlain.

The Newsflash provides information relating to Carlton and the work and achievements of CRA and is distributed in both hard and electronic copy to members, politicians, inner city resident groups and other interested parties.

Each edition is posted on the CRA website and provides a comprehensive historical reference of CRA activities. These date back to 2002.

A small group of volunteers has helped to deliver each edition of the Newsflash. This is very much appreciated and saves on postage.

If you would like to only receive an electronic copy please email secretarycra@gmail.com

The website provides access to information that will keep members up to date, inform others of the Association's work and hopefully encourage participation in CRA activities. It would be encouraging to think that members access the website regularly.

Members are invited to comment or make suggestions regarding any of the above. Please do so using the secretarycra@gmail.com email address

The committee has made the decision to delete the facebook page – there had been little or no activity since 2016 and this provided a poor representation of CRA.

2019 AGM

AGM attendees heard from Greg John who spoke about the very successful Church of All Nations Family Learning program, commonly known as the Homework Program, which runs on Mondays, Tuesdays and Wednesdays from 4pm to 6pm at Kathleen Syme Library and Community Centre.

The following committee members and office bearers were voted in:

- Ivana Csar, President
- Trish O'Loughlin, Vice President
- Philip Watts, Treasurer
- Farida Fleming, Secretary
- Antoinette Sagaria, Ordinary Member and Convenor of the Planning working group
- Lester Levinson, Ordinary Member and Convenor of the TTPNA working group
- Margaret Rode, Ordinary Member and Representative on the Safe City Camera Program Audit Committee
- Peter Sanders Ordinary Member

2019 Christmas Party

CRA again hosted the much-loved Christmas party at La Mama's Drummond St theatre, thanks to the generosity of La Mama. Members and friends enjoyed traditional Irish music by the talented Dougal Adams and Ado Barker, generous contributions of food from Brunetti and Clyde Hotel, and the excellent raffle with wonderful prizes sourced by Trish O'Loughlin. This year members and friends heard from Dr Xavier Csar about the importance of Federation Square as a public space, the importance of this site to the Original Owners of this land and plans for its future.

Carlton Residents Association - AGM 17th February 2020

Strategic Planning Report – Overview of key 2019 Activities

Much of this report was included in the December 2019 Edition of the *CRA Newsflash*; the highlighted sections are 2020 updates as at 5th February 2020

Corkman Hotel

Planning Scheme Amendment C346 [approved by the Minister on the 18 October in 2018] applied an Incorporated Plan Overlay Schedule 6 over the site, which will require the current owner to prepare an Incorporated Plan. Unfortunately this new Schedule 6 will not require the current owners to reinstate the valued heritage fabric of the illegally demolished pub, or require any new development on the site to ‘fall within’ a modified building envelope. According to a press report in 2019 [Clay Lucas, *The Age*, 29 May 2019]

*The developers who unlawfully demolished Carlton’s Corkman Irish Pub in 2016 have reached a deal with the Andrews government to clear the site **and temporarily turn it into a park by the end of November [2019].***

The agreement means that Shaqiri and Kutlesovski have agreed to clear the site and, by 30 November, build an “informal outdoor recreation” area on it.

The pair then have until 2022 to redevelop the site in a form approved by the planning minister.

According to a further press report on 30 January 2020 [The Age]

The state government will take developers who razed the historic Corkman Irish Pub to court again, seeking an order forcing them to build a temporary public park at the Carlton site.

If an enforcement order is issued and the developers again fail to build the park, Mr Wynne [The Planning Minister] said, the council would step in to build it and seek the costs from Mr Shaqiri and Mr Kutlesovski [the developers].

Heritage Review Amendment C258 Melbourne Planning Scheme. The Panel Hearings in relation to this citywide Planning Scheme Amendment commenced in August 2018 [and continued in 2019]. The major issue canvassed by the CRA during the Panel Hearing [and in earlier submissions] concerned the efficacy of the translation of the old letter grades [to signify the level of significance of a heritage place] to the new grading system of Significant, Contributory and Non-Contributory. During the concluding stages of the Panel Hearings, the CRA submitted supplementary material to elaborate upon these ‘translation’ issues and other matters. **The Panel Report in relation to the Amendment [21 May 2019] rejected the use of Heritage Place Gradings in the Exhibited Inventories to signify a level of Significance. In the Panel’s view, the threshold for which a place is considered important should be indicated in the Statement of Significance for the Heritage Place.** It is expected that the Council’s response to the Panel Report will be submitted to an FMC Meeting in early 2020. **[This will not happen before the 18th February 2020 at the earliest].**

Review of the Heritage Places of Carlton. This more comprehensive study of the Heritage Places of Carlton was originally to be confined to that section of Carlton to the east of Swanston Street. Although this Review was expected to be exhibited in 2019, the CRA has now been advised that it is unlikely to be exhibited until mid-2020, following the Gazettal of Am C258.

Melbourne Innovation District [MID] - City North.

On Saturday 23 March 2019 a community workshop was convened by the CRA and City of Melbourne to invite feedback from Carlton residents on a draft *Urban Realm Action Plan: Melbourne Innovation Districts (MID) City North, 2018–2023* (‘the Plan’). David Week kindly facilitated this workshop, and Lisa Adams assumed the role of Rapporteur.

The City of Melbourne presented the main points of the Plan. This was followed by comments from CRA invitees, who were asked to focus their comments using the following format:

- What is the problem or opportunity?
- What are possible solutions?
- What are the benefits, and for whom?

Lisa Adams was the key author of the Association's submission to the Council: ***MID City North Carlton Workshop Communiqué***.

Planning Scheme Amendment C278 Sunlight to Public Parks

This Amendment was the subject of a comprehensive submission from the Association in August 2019. This submission addressed the following key issues.

- While many of the height controls in the Carlton area are recommended maximum building heights, which may be exceeded, **the CRA accepts that for the purpose of determining whether a park falls within a low scale or a growth area, that these recommended maximum heights can, and should, provide the appropriate benchmark.** Further, while the limited additional overshadowing test is also based upon discretionary street wall heights/building heights, the CRA accepts that these discretionary heights should be regarded as mandatory for the purposes of this test.
- The designation of Argyle Square as a Park Type 2 cannot be accepted. This square is surrounded by a DDO which provides for a maximum building height of 4 storeys. Although this height may be exceeded, given the preponderance of low scale heritage places located on Argyle Place North, and the strongly worded DDO Design Objectives [which seek to maintain the predominant low scale of the area to support 'high levels of pedestrian amenity related to access to sunlight and sky views ...'] this area cannot be considered as a Growth Area.

Sadly, the Council Officers have REJECTED the CRA's Submission in relation to Argyle Square. They believe that, contrary to the clear low scale height expectations articulated in the Melbourne Planning Scheme, this Square should be treated in the SAME way as those squares [Lincoln and University Squares] that are located in the City North Growth Area WEST of Swanston Street.

Melbourne Business School Development Application

This major development on the North side of Pelham Street [Between Leicester and Bouverie Streets] was the subject of a detailed submission to the Department of Environment, Land, Water and Planning in October 2019. This submission raised the following concerns:

- Key heritage objectives and guidelines included within the relevant Local Policy and the Design and Development Overlay [DDO61] have not been satisfied.
- The net community benefit of this development does not justify such a major departure from the built form guidance provided by DDO61.
- Although the development falls within the Victorian Government's Parkville National Employment and Innovation Cluster, we do not believe that this fact justifies departing from key MPS guidance, and that
- Where an applicant wishes to depart from gazetted Planning Controls in a substantial way [as in the current proposal] they should be required to seek approval through a Planning Scheme Amendment.

Ewan Ogilvy [Member of CRA Planning Network]

5th February 2020