



# CARLTON RESIDENTS ASSOCIATION

Thank you for the opportunity to respond to this application.

## **Introduction**

We, the Carlton Residents Association are extremely concerned about two recent proposed developments in this World Heritage Area:

1. St. Vincent's Hospital **PLN20/0567: 27 & 31 Victoria Parade, Fitzroy**
2. Gertrude St. *PLN20/0566: 1-9 Gertrude Street. Fitzroy*

Both of these are in one of the most sensitive parts of the World Heritage Royal Exhibition Building and Carlton Gardens World Heritage Environs Area and allowing these developments may set a precedent for further erosion of the Buffer Zone around the significant area.

The significance of this site, taken as a whole - the Royal Exhibition Building, the Carlton Gardens, and the surrounds - cannot be overestimated. 'The expositional ensemble comprising the Melbourne Exhibition Building and the Carlton Gardens is a unique, magnificent and outstanding survivor from this great age of great exhibitions. There is nothing like it anywhere else in the world today', wrote the eminent UK historian, Professor David Cannadine.

All this was recognised in its nomination as a World Heritage site.

The responsibility of preserving the integrity of the WHEA east of the Carlton Gardens now falls upon Yarra City Council and of course indirectly Melbourne City council of which Carlton is a part. Although St Vincent's isn't a part of the WHEA it is surrounded by the WHEA controls and must comply with the broad intentions of the WHEA.

Both of these proposals under consideration are now before the Yarra Council..... but not Melbourne City Council.

Additionally, both of these proposals pose a threat to the integrity of the whole of the World Heritage Environs Area- WHEA, of which The Carlton Residents Association are a part of and we feel strongly that we must support the integrity of the WHEA.



# CARLTON RESIDENTS ASSOCIATION

## **1. PLN20/0567: 27 & 31 Victoria Parade, Fitzroy**

The development at 27 & 31 Victoria Parade, Fitzroy proposed by St Vincent's Hospital Board of Management is directly opposite the World Heritage Carlton Gardens on Eastern Hill and on a prominent boulevard facing south down to Parliament area and the buffer zone and North West through the Carlton Gardens to the Royal Exhibition Building.

At 15 metres higher than the existing building, the proposed development will have an external glass reflective skin, and will dominate the hospital complex and challenge the integrity of the Royal Exhibition Building. The development is within a local hospital planning zone, in the World Heritage Environs Area and the local heritage overlay (HO334).

While acknowledging the history of the site, the evolved nature of the hospital complex in the location, as well as the community benefits which would derive from the proposed development, the proposed new building is designed to be visually prominent and architecturally striking and as such could be seen as to compete with the visual prominence of the REB. A new building of lesser scale, which more closely aligns with the height of the existing Aikenhead Wing, and with a quieter architectural expression, would be preferable in this World Heritage protected area.

The redevelopment of the Aikenhead Wing represents an opportunity to improve the response to this significant heritage area. We are asking that the design respect and respond to its heritage context and not exceed the height of the existing Aikenhead Wing.



# CARLTON RESIDENTS ASSOCIATION

## 2. *PLN20/0566: 1-9 Gertrude Street. Fitzroy*

The development at 1- 9, Gertrude Street, Fitzroy will be 21.5 metres in height plus plant. This is about 7 times higher than the single storey rear properties of the Victoria Heritage Listed Royal Terraces and twice as high as the front of the Terraces that look directly to the eastern side of the REB.

The development will impact on the skyline over the Royal Terraces from the Royal Exhibition Building and will block the view from the Royal Exhibition Building public promenade deck to heritage Fitzroy.

Despite the setback along its Gertrude Street frontage and Marion Lane rear, it will obscure the significant views of the Royal Exhibition Building drum and dome and flagpole, from both the street and lane.

We are not against development on this site. On the contrary, we consider this site offers opportunity for a new development to demonstrate that new can be integrated into the older and significant heritage. The maximum building height should be no more than the parapet height of Royal Terrace in Nicholson Street. This can be achieved by the new building sitting respectfully with its neighbouring properties, design features that emulate the vernacular, while adding to the amenity and liveability of the area, through its commercial uses, and best sustainability inclusions.

## **Conclusion.**

The redevelopment of both St Vincent's Hospital and Gertrude Street represent an opportunity to improve the response to this significant heritage area.

We are asking that Yarra Council respect and respond to its heritage context.

Allowing these two developments to be considered is setting a dangerous precedent.

Perhaps the time has come for the whole of the WHEA area to be managed under one umbrella instead of the present unwieldy situation with both Melbourne and Yarra Councils.

Patricia O'Loughlin - CRA Committee Member

1.3 139 Rathdowne Street

Carlton 3053

0408100844